Phage loss and the breakdown of a defensive symbiosis in aphids

S. R. Weldon, M. R. Strand and K. M. Oliver

Department of Entomology, University of Georgia, Athens, GA 30602, USA

Terrestrial arthropods are often infected with heritable bacterial symbionts, which may themselves be infected by bacteriophages. However, what role, if any, bacteriophages play in the regulation and maintenance of insect–bacteria symbioses is largely unknown. Infection of the aphid *Acyrthosiphon pisum* by the bacterial symbiont *Hamiltonella defensa* confers protection against parasitoid wasps, but only when *H. defensa* is itself infected by the phage *A. pisum* secondary endosymbiont (APSE). Here, we use a controlled genetic background and correlation-based assays to show that loss of APSE is associated with up to sevenfold increases in the intra-aphid abundance of *H. defensa*. APSE loss is also associated with severe deleterious effects on aphid fitness: aphids infected with *H. defensa* lacking APSE have a significantly delayed onset of reproduction, lower weight at adulthood and half as many total offspring as aphids infected with phage-harbouring *H. defensa*, indicating that phage loss can rapidly lead to the breakdown of the defensive symbiosis. Our results overall indicate that bacteriophages play critical roles in both aphid defence and the maintenance of heritable symbiosis.

1. Introduction

Bacteriophages are the most abundant biological entities on the Earth, and they perform key ecological functions at scales ranging from local to global [1]. Among free-living bacteria, phages can influence host population dynamics via host cell lysis and other mechanisms, which can affect community structure. Temperate phages often encode functional pathways, such as antibiotic resistance or virulence factors, which enhance bacterial host fitness, and vector these traits within and among bacterial lineages [2]. Many bacterial lineages, however, persist only in association with animal cells. Heritable bacterial infections, for example, are widespread among terrestrial arthropods, where many have evolved into beneficial symbionts that provide nutritional or defensive services [3,4]. Several heritable symbionts also harbour phage infections, yet the prevalence and roles of phages in heritable symbioses remain poorly understood [5,6].

A bacteriophage named *Acyrthosiphon pisum* secondary endosymbiont (APSE) infects *Hamiltonella defensa*, a gamma-proteobacterial symbiont of aphids and related insects [7–10]. APSEs are temperate bacteriophages related to the lambdoid phage P22 (Podoviridae) [7,11]. There are two APSE variants (APSE-2 and APSE-3) commonly found in North American populations of *A. pisum*. Each variant shares a core of conserved genes but also contains a variable region consisting of holin, lysozyme and toxin genes from two protein families: cytolethal distending toxin (CdtB; APSE-2), and YD-repeat toxin (Ydp; APSE-3) [8,9]. Phylogenetic evidence shows that APSEs move these pathways horizontally between *H. defensa* lineages [9]. Prior studies with the pea aphid, *A. pisum*, established that *H. defensa* confers protection against an important natural enemy, the parasitic wasp *Aphidius ervi*, by killing wasp offspring that otherwise develop within the aphid haemocoel [12,13]. This protective phenotype was further found to depend on whether the bacterial symbiont was infected by APSE, and to differ with phage variant: *H. defensa* strains carrying APSE-3 confer near-complete resistance and those with APSE-2 confer partial resistance [10,14].

Given the lytic capabilities of phages, APSEs and other temperate viruses have the potential to influence symbiont abundance in insect hosts. Within-host bacterial abundance can affect conferred phenotypes [15,16], rates of horizontal transfer and establishment of novel infections [17], and maintenance of tripartite symbioses [18,19]. All stable beneficial heritable symbiont infections must also be coordinated between host and symbiont(s) to strike a balance between sufficient titre to produce the beneficial phenotype and ensure vertical transmission to progeny, while limiting over-replication that might be detrimental to host fitness [19]. The mechanisms underlying the regulation of heritable symbionts, however, are poorly understood. Hosts may restrict symbionts to particular tissues and the host immune system may regulate symbiont infection [20–22], though some facultative symbionts maintain a pathogen-like capacity for colonization of novel host tissues. Symbionts, in turn, may use chemical communication (e.g. quorum sensing) to assess titres, but quorum sensing has been characterized in only one heritable insect symbiont, *Sodalis* [23]. Temperature has also been shown to affect within-host density of endosymbionts in several insects [24], including wasps in the genus *Nasonia*, where temperature decreases the abundance of *Wolbachia* but increases the abundance of the phage WO [18]. We became interested in the role of APSE in regulation of *H. defensa* densities when we anecdotally observed that haemolymph from *A. pism* infected with *H. defensa* lacking APSE contained higher densities of this symbiont than aphids infected by *H. defensa* with APSE. To elaborate on this observation, we conducted a set of experimental and correlation-based studies to examine whether APSE was responsible for reducing symbiont titres, and if so, whether phage loss and symbiont deregulation affect aphid fitness.

### 2. Material and methods

#### (a) Study organisms

*Acyrthosiphon pisum* is a cosmopolitan pest of herbaceous legumes, including important forage crops [25]. In most temperate regions, *A. pism* is cyclically parthenogenetic; aphids reproduce asexually and viviparously for most of the growing season, and only in response to a shortening photoperiod in autumn are sexual morphs produced, which lay overwintering eggs [26]. In the laboratory, clonal lines can be maintained indefinitely by mimicking long day-length conditions. Single parthenogenetic females collected from the field were used to initiate the lines in this study (see the electronic supplementary material, table S1). All aphids were reared on *Vicia faba* on a 16 L : 8 D cycle at temperature of 19 ± 1°C.

In laboratory-reared pea aphid clones, *H. defensa* is vertically transmitted at rates approaching 100 per cent [4]. APSE-3 infections are also transmitted with very high fidelity, but can be spontaneously lost at very low rates [14]. We therefore used previously established sub-lines from the aphid clone 5A that had been inoculated with the APSE-3-harbouring strain A1A (A1A + ![](http://rspb.royalsocietypublishing.org/); 82B, collected in Cayuga Co, NY 2000) via microinjection into line 5A, but were established by a single transfer of A1A (A1A − ![](http://rspb.royalsocietypublishing.org/)) into line 5A-1 and 82B + ![](http://rspb.royalsocietypublishing.org/); 5A-2 were established by a single transfer of *H. defensa* (82B, collected in Cayuga Co, NY 2000) via microinjection into line 5A, but parthenogenetically reproducing lines were maintained separately for at least 3 years [13]. All other aphid clonal lines used in this study contained their natural symbiont infections (see the electronic supplementary material, table S1).

#### (b) APSE effects on Hamiltonella defensa titres

(i) To determine whether phage loss influences symbiont abundance, we used real-time quantitative PCR (qPCR) to compare *H. defensa* titres in aphids that share the same genotype and symbiont strain, but that differed in status of phage infection (*A1A−![](http://rspb.royalsocietypublishing.org/) − ![](http://rspb.royalsocietypublishing.org/)A1A![](http://rspb.royalsocietypublishing.org/)). To create cohorts of equal-aged aphids, between 10 and 15 actively reproducing female *A. pism* were placed on a single *V. faba* plant. The 24 h cohorts were produced within ± 2 h, all other cohorts (i.e. 48−336 h) were produced within ± 4 h. Aphids were destructively sampled and each time point represents a unique cohort. Quantities of aphid symbiont levels at different time points during development (24−336 h) were then determined by preparing whole aphid DNA extractions in a lysis buffer (10 mM Tris–Cl, pH 8.2; 1 mM EDTA; 25 mM NaCl) with 1 per cent proteinase K (20 mg ml−1) scaled by aphid size from 10 µl for a first instar aphid to 100 µl for adults [27]. Standard curves for quantification were produced...
via serial dilutions from 1E2 to 1E9 [28], and efficiencies for all quantification reactions were above 93 per cent. After extraction, aphids from line A1A+ to 5A were first tested using diagnostic PCR to confirm phage infection (primers and reaction conditions in table 1). Unique fragments of the single-copy gene dnaK were used to quantify the abundance of H. defensa by qPCR (table 1). For all aphid ages except for 336 h, the relative bacterial and phage titres were calibrated using the aphid gene EF1α to account for differences in extraction efficiency and body size. All 10 μl reactions were performed on a Roche LightCycler 480 II using Roche LightCycler 480 SYBR Green I Master chemistry and 0.5 μM of each primer. Preincubation: 95 °C for 5 min; amplification (repeated 45 times): 95 °C for 10 s, 68 °C to 55 °C touchdown with 10 steps each at 1 °C, 72 °C for 10 s; melting curve: 95 °C for 5 s, 65 °C for 1 min, then ramped to 97 °C; hold at 40 °C.

(ii) We also discovered that one sub-line of clone A1A+ to 5A produced a small percentage of offspring infected with H. defensa but without APSE-3. This finding allowed us to examine the differences in symbiont titre between phage negative and phage positive siblings from the same (phage positive) mother. We used qPCR, as described earlier, to estimate H. defensa titres from 24 ± 2 h APSE-infected and APSE-free offspring produced by a single mother aphid. Diagnostic PCR was used to determine phage infection status.

(iii) Diagnostic screening identified additional laboratory-held clonal A. pisum lines that were either fixed or lacked APSE-3 (see the electronic supplementary material, table S1). Using the same protocols, we conducted qPCR on the 72 ± 4 h offspring of four clones infected with H. defensa plus APSE-3 and three clones without APSE to determine if phage-free lines generally have higher H. defensa titres than phage-infected lines.

(iv) The other common North American phage variant, APSE-2, has never been reported lost from a laboratory-held plant in an isolated cup cage. Offspring of all cohorts had no surviving adults. Plants were changed every 3 days after the onset of reproduction. The number of surviving adults from the initial cohort was also noted at each time point until day 26. At this point, most aphids had ceased reproducing and more than a quarter of all cohorts had no surviving adults. Plants were changed occasionally to promote optimal conditions for aphid development. We also examined development time, defined here as time from birth to first reproduction (TFR). To determine TFR,

3. Results
(a) APSE-3 loss is associated with increases in Hamiltonella defensa titre
The A1A+ to 5A sub-lines, identical in aphid genotype and H. defensa strain but differing in APSE-3 infection status, allowed us to experimentally investigate the consequences of phage loss. Our qPCR estimates of symbiont abundance revealed that phage-free aphids contained significantly more H. defensa than aphids with APSE-3 at all examined time points in aphid development (figure 1a). Hamiltonella defensa titres rose throughout aphid development, such that older aphids lacking APSE contained much larger numbers of H. defensa than adult aphids with phage (figure 1a).

(c) Effects of phage loss on aphid fitness
To assess the effects of phage loss on aphid fitness, we compared three aphid fitness parameters (fecundity, development time and fresh weight at adulthood) in our experimental lines (A1A+ to 5A) that shared the same genotype and symbiont strain, but differed in phage infection status. Fitness assays were conducted as in Oliver et al. [28]. For each replicate (n = 10) of the fecundity assay, a cohort of four similarly aged (±16 h), pre-reproductive, apterous female aphids were placed on a single V. faba plant in an isolated cup cage. Offspring were counted and removed every 3 days after the onset of reproduction. The number of surviving adults from the initial cohort was also noted at each time point until day 26. At this point, most aphids had ceased reproducing and more than a quarter of all cohorts had no surviving adults. Plants were changed occasionally to promote optimal conditions for aphid development. We also examined development time, defined here as time from birth to first reproduction (TFR). To determine TFR,
(b) Phage loss results in immediate increases in Hamiltonella defensa titres

In a sub-line of clone A1A⁺, which infrequently produced APSE-free offspring, we compared symbiont titres of 24 h offspring produced by a single APSE-3/H. defensa positive mother and found that nymphs lacking APSE-3 carried on average 83 per cent more H. defensa than their phage-harbouring sisters (figure 1b; ANOVA, F₁,₁₄ = 6.0, p = 0.03), indicating that phage loss results in immediate increases in H. defensa abundance per aphid.

(c) Phage-free lines generally exhibit higher Hamiltonella defensa titres

We screened 72 h offspring of laboratory-held lines infected with H. defensa and APSE-3, and lines infected

---

Figure 1. Bacteriophage APSE affects H. defensa abundance. (N denotes nymphal instar, t-test, *p < 0.05; **p < 0.01; ***p < 0.001.) Columns represent mean symbiont abundances for APSE-3 infected (dark) and phage-free (open) treatments: numbers above columns indicate number of aphids in the treatment. Bars represent 95% Cs. (a) H. defensa titres in experimental line A1A⁺ → 5A (aphid clone 5A infected with H. defensa A1A and with phage APSE-3) versus line A1A⁻ → 5A (aphid clone 5A infected with H. defensa A1A but without phage APSE-3). (b) H. defensa titres in siblings from the experimental line demonstrating changed H. defensa titres within a single generation. All aphids, with and without phage, used for the 24 h time point were the offspring of a single A1A⁺ → 5A mother. (c) H. defensa titres in 72 h (second instar) clonal lineages with and without APSE-3. ANOVA comparison of summed phage-infected group to summed phage-free group is presented at top; individual lines were compared via post hoc Tukey–Kramer HSD: shared letters (y or z) indicate levels not significantly different. (d) APSE-2 and H. defensa in lines 82B → 5A-1 and 82B → 5A-2.
Table 2. Aphid fitness assays in experimental lines with APSE (A1A− → 5A) and without APSE (A1A+ → 5A). (Includes maternal age (h) at time of first live offspring produced, maternal mass immediately after first reproduction and total offspring produced by cohorts of four adult aphids by age 26 days. The statistical test used for each fitness measure is shown in the right column. *p*-values in each case were also highly significant. Means are in bold text.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>assay</th>
<th>+ APSE-3</th>
<th>− APSE-3</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>time to first reproduction (h)</td>
<td>range</td>
<td>range</td>
<td>0.000006 (Wilcoxon rank-sum)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>mean</td>
<td>mean</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>aphids</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fresh weight (mg)</td>
<td>range</td>
<td>range</td>
<td>0.0002 (t-test)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>mean</td>
<td>mean</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>aphids</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>offspring per cage by day 26</td>
<td>range</td>
<td>range</td>
<td>&lt;0.0001 (t-test)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>mean</td>
<td>mean</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cages</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

with phage-free *H. defensa* (see the electronic supplementary material, table S1) to determine whether phage-free lines generally contain higher symbiont titres. We found that clones lacking APSE-3 contained on average more than twice the number of *H. defensa* per aphid than clones with APSE-3 (figure 1c; ANOVA $F_{6,33} = 11.85$, $p < 0.0001$).

(d) APSE-2 and *Hamiltonella defensa* titres have an inverse relationship

To determine whether APSE-free lines also influenced symbiont titres, we assessed the abundance of *H. defensa* and phage in lines sharing the same aphid background (5A) and same *H. defensa* strain and APSE-2 haplotype (from line 82B). We found that aphids from the 82B − 5A-1 line contained more APSE-2 than aphids from the 82B − 5A-2 line (figure 1d). Conversely, the abundance of *H. defensa* was significantly lower in 82B − 5A-1 aphids than 82B − 5A-2 aphids (figure 1d), indicating an inverse association between phage and symbiont titre.

(e) APSE loss has severely deleterious effects on measures of aphid fitness

The loss of APSE and concomitant rise in the abundance of *H. defensa* could affect aphid fitness. To test this idea, we used the A1A− → 5A and A1A+ → 5A aphid sub-lines, which were genetically identical and contained the same strain of *H. defensa* but differed in whether or not they contained APSE-3. We then measured three fitness parameters: fecundity, development time and fresh weight at adulthood. In each instance, our results showed that the absence of APSE-3 significantly increased fitness costs to the aphid host (table 2). Aphids lacking APSE-3 (line A1A− → 5A) reproduced, on average, 18 h later than A1A+ → 5A aphids with APSE-3. They also weighed 20 per cent less than their phage-harboung counterparts at adulthood, and produced roughly half as many offspring (table 2).

(f) *Hamiltonella defensa* is vertically transmitted with high fidelity with and without APSE

We have held numerous *H. defensa*-infected lines with and without APSE in continuous culture for many years (see the electronic supplementary material, table S1), and despite routine screening, we have not detected any losses of *H. defensa*. On the basis of a conservative average of 30 generations per year, we calculated the number of generations with successful vertical transmission [30]. We estimated 1470 generations of successful transfer in APSE-3 infected lines and 540 generations in APSE-free *H. defensa*-infected lines.

(g) APSE-2 has higher vertical transmission fidelity than APSE-3

We currently maintain 16 aphid lines bearing APSE-2− *H. defensa*, most of which have been held for at least 1 year, and despite routine screening, we have documented no instances of APSE-2 loss, including in one line held, in multiple subclones, for more than 12 years. By contrast, we have held at least 10 lines infected with APSE-3, and most have lost phage within 4 years (see the electronic supplementary material, table S1).

4. Discussion

By controlling aphid genotype, symbiont genotype and environmental conditions, such as temperature, this study shows that APSE reduces within-host densities of *H. defensa*. In lines with identical aphid genotypes and *H. defensa* strains, APSE loss resulted in significant increases in *H. defensa* titre across all examined time points ranging from first instar nymphs to adults (figure 1a). While it is possible that additional changes (other than APSE loss) which influence *H. defensa* abundance have occurred in our clonal experimental lines, our finding that APSE-free offspring contain fewer *H. defensa* than their APSE-3-harbouring siblings (figure 1b), strongly suggests that phage loss results in immediate increases in symbiont titres in this line (figure 1b) and that APSE loss alone is a sufficient explanation for *H. defensa* titre differences we observe in the experimental lines. Furthermore, among genetically diverse *A. pisum* lines, those lacking APSE-3 consistently contain roughly twice the number of *H. defensa* as lines maintaining the phage (figure 1c). These experimental and correlation-based findings indicate that APSE-3 infection significantly reduces the abundance of *H. defensa* in *A. pisum*. While no APSE-2 loss event has been reported, genetically identical aphid sub-lines
with the same strain of *H. defensa* have *H. defensa* titres inversely associated with APSE-2 titre. This inverse relationship is consistent with the lysis of *H. defensa* by APSE-2, and, along with our APSE-3 results, suggests that APSE-2 also reduces the abundance of *H. defensa* in *A. pismum*.

We also found that the higher *H. defensa* titres associated with phage loss correlated with severe fitness costs to *A. pismum*. In our experimental line sharing *H. defensa* strain and aphid genotype, phage-free *H. defensa*-infected aphids developed more slowly, reached a smaller fresh weight at adulthood, and produced approximately 50 per cent fewer offspring than their APSE-3-infected counterparts (table 2). The underlying cause of these costs was not investigated, but *H. defensa* is auxotrophic for most essential amino acids and probably relies on the aphid and its obligate nutritional symbiont *Buchnera aphidicola* for growth [31], and increases in *H. defensa* abundance may reduce resources available for aphid growth and reproduction.

Costs associated with phage loss may play an important role in the maintenance of this protective symbiosis. *Hamiltonella defensa* is found at intermediate frequencies in nature [28,32] and most field-collected *H. defensa*-infected aphids are also infected by APSE [14,33]. Population cage studies reveal that aphids infected with *H. defensa* and APSE-3 rapidly spread to near-fixation when parasitism pressure is present, whereas uninfected aphids are favoured in the absence of parasitism [29]. Thus, aphids infected with *H. defensa* plus APSE have a fitness advantage over uninfected aphids when exposed to parasitism pressure, owing to the resistance traits APSE encodes. By contrast, aphids infected by *H. defensa* alone derive no protection from parasitism and incur higher fitness costs than aphids infected by *H. defensa* plus APSE. Moreover, while individual *H. defensa* cells could benefit from the absence of APSE infection, the within-host reductions in symbiont density APSE causes do not appear to adversely affect transmission fidelity, as symbiont inheritance approaches 100 per cent under standard laboratory conditions whether or not APSE is present. We conclude that APSE is probably essential for maintenance of the *H. defensa*–aphid symbiosis because its loss favours reductions in the prevalence of symbiont-infected aphids under conditions of both high and low parasitism pressure. APSE is therefore a vital component in the *H. defensa*–aphid symbiosis not only because of the pathways it encodes but also for its ability to regulate symbiont density without compromising transmission fidelity. The loss of this bacteriophage, by contrast, leads to an immediate proliferation of bacterial symbionts, deleterious effects on the animal host and the rapid breakdown of the heritable symbiosis.

The fitness costs of phage loss to aphids may also explain why aphids harbouring APSE-2 are maintained in natural populations despite being inferior protectors against parasitism. We found that, in the laboratory, APSE-2–*H. defensa* interactions appear more stable than those involving APSE-3, albeit in a limited sample (see the electronic supplementary material, table S1). The underlying basis for the differential persistence of APSE-2 and -3 is currently unclear. The reduction in *H. defensa* titre that occurs with phage infection suggests both phage variants undergo lytic cycles, but both also persist in *H. defensa* as integrated prophages [10]. Thus, differences in the timing of lytic and lysogenic activity during the life cycle of the aphid or *H. defensa* may underlie the differential persistence of these APSE variants. Given evidence that higher temperatures reduce the protective benefits of *H. defensa*, abiotic factors may play a role in the within-host dynamics between APSE and *H. defensa* [34]. Studies with *Nasonia* also show that temperature shock reduces the abundance of *Wolbachia* while increasing the abundance of phage WO [18].

In general, phage infections have the potential to exert dynamic and profound influences on animal–bacterial symbioses. In addition to encoding pathways that benefit both the bacterial and animal hosts [8,10,14], bacteriophages may alter symbiont abundance within individual hosts and thereby play critical roles in the maintenance of heritable symbiosis within host populations.

We thank Nicole Ferguson, Nasreen Bano and Eric Katz for technical assistance. This project was supported by a National Science Foundation (IOS) grant no. 1050128 to K.M.O. Data presented in this paper are available at doi:10.5061/dryad.fc54e.

References
