Subordinate superb fairy-wrens (*Malurus cyaneus*) parasitize the reproductive success of attractive dominant males

Michael C. Double† and Andrew Cockburn

Evolutionary Ecology Group, School of Botany and Zoology, Australian National University, Canberra, ACT 0200, Australia

Explanations of cooperative breeding have largely focused on the indirect benefits philopatric offspring gain from investing in kin. However, recent molecular studies have revealed that in many species subordinates provision unrelated offspring. This has led to the re-evaluation of the direct and indirect benefits of helping behaviour. In this study, we used microsatellite genotyping to assess the extra-group reproductive success of subordinate superb fairy-wrens (*Malurus cyaneus*), a species with extremely high rates of extra-group paternity. Extra-group subordinate males sired 10.2% (193 out of 1895) of all offspring sampled between 1993 and 2000 and 21.4% (193 out of 901) of all illegitimate offspring sired by known males. The extra-group success of subordinates was greatly influenced by the attractiveness of their dominant male. Subordinates of attractive dominants sired more extra-group young than did average dominants. Evidence suggests that mate choice in superb fairy-wrens is error-prone and subordinates can gain direct reproductive benefits through parasitizing the reproductive success of attractive dominants.

**Keywords:** sexual selection; extra-pair copulation; avian mating systems; *Malurus cyaneus*; mate choice; hidden leks

1. INTRODUCTION

Traditionally, cooperative-breeding theory has emphasized the indirect benefits that philopatric offspring gain from investing in kin (Emlen et al. 1995; Emlen 1997). This perspective is now challenged by the increased recognition that helping can be influenced by deferred benefits such as group augmentation (Clutton-Brock 2002) and immediate benefits from access to reproduction (Magrath & Whittingham 1997; Cockburn 1998; Richardson et al. 2003).

Cockburn (2003) found that in 15 out of the 29 cooperatively breeding birds studied using molecular analyses, paternity was commonly shared within the group (more than 20% of broods) if the group contained more than one male to which the female was unrelated. In some cooperative breeders there is also considerable extra-group paternity (Seychelles warbler, *Acrocephalus sechellensis* (Richardson et al. 2001); western bluebird, *Sialia mexicana* (Dickinson & Akre 1998); red-billed buffalow, *Bubalonimbus niger* (Winterbottom et al. 2001); white-browed scrubbird, *Sericornis frontalis* (Whittingham et al. 1997); splendid fairy-wren, *Malurus splendidus* (Brooker et al. 1990); and the superb fairy-wren, *Malurus cyaneus* (Mulder & Cockburn 1993; Dunn & Cockburn 1999)) but it is unclear whether subordinates share these benefits.

Superb fairy-wrens show extreme rates of extra-group paternity (more than 60% of offspring; Mulder et al. 1994; Dunn & Cockburn 1999). High-quality males are most likely to sire extra-group young (Dunn & Cockburn 1999; Green et al. 2000), but subordinates are reproductively competent (Mulder & Cockburn 1993) and can achieve both within-group (Cockburn et al. 2003) and extra-group success (Mulder et al. 1994; Dunn & Cockburn 1999).

The high rates of extra-group paternity result in low levels of relatedness between subordinates and offspring but helpers always provision young (Dunn et al. 1995). However, evidence suggests that helping does not enhance group productivity (Green et al. 1995; Dunn & Cockburn 1996).

In order to reassess helping behaviour in this species, we used a microsatellite-based genotyping system to determine the reproductive success of subordinate males in a dataset of 1944 offspring sampled over eight breeding seasons. We examine the distribution of extra-group reproductive success among subordinate males and question why subordinate males sire any extra-group offspring.

2. METHODS

(a) **Study species and study site**

Since 1988 we have studied a colour-banded population of superb fairy-wrens breeding in and around the Australian National Botanic Gardens in Canberra. The study area covers ca. 70 ha (85 wren territories) and is surrounded by Canberra Nature Park and the Australian National University campus, which support contiguous wren territories.

Fairy-wrens are resident throughout the year, and during the breeding season a socially monogamous pair occupies each territory. While pairs have exclusive ownership of about half the territories, one to four subordinate males can also assist the pair. Male fairy-wrens show strong natal philopatry whereas juvenile females are forced to leave their natal territory to find a breeding vacancy (Mulder 1995). Females may later divorce their mates but will rarely move more than one or two territories (Cockburn et al. 2003). Owing to the high turnover of females and the extreme level of infidelity, males often help raise unrelated offspring (Dunn et al. 1995). The oldest and earliest-moulting male
on a territory is always dominant. Subordinates defer to the dominant male during aggressive encounters and dominants will monopolize access to the female during her fertile period (Cockburn et al. 2003).

Female superb fairy-wrens retain their brown plumage throughout the year, whereas males moult from a brown to a bright blue and black nuptial plumage up to eight months prior to the start of the breeding season. Almost all males attain full nuptial plumage and a few males (less than 2%) maintain nuptial plumage throughout the year. Males in nuptial plumage regularly display to neighbouring females (Rowley 1991; Mulder 1997; Green et al. 2000) and females appear to use the timing of the moult as an indicator of male quality. Males that retain or moult earliest into nuptial plumage almost always sire extra-group young (Dunn & Cockburn 1999; Green et al. 2000). Extra-group copulations are controlled by females and occur in a predictable context: 2–4 days prior to laying their first eggs, females conduct pre-dawn forays to nearby territories to copulate with extra-group males (Double & Cockburn 2000).

The study population was monitored throughout each year and the timing of the moult into nuptial plumage was recorded for every resident male. During each breeding season every territory was visited at least three times a week to assess breeding activity and group composition. In this paper, the term ‘dominant’ refers to the senior male on a territory but does not necessarily imply the presence of subordinate males.

(b) Microsatellite genotyping

Nestlings were banded between 5 and 7 days after hatching and a small blood sample was taken for DNA profiling (Double et al. 1997). We used microsatellite genotyping to assign paternity to all nestling fairy-wrens produced in the study area between 1993 and 2000. Between five and seven hypervariable microsatellite loci were amplified for each individual (Double et al. 1997) and run on an ABI377 sequencer (Perkin–Elmer). Internal size standards were run with all PCR products and allele sizes were determined using Genescan v. 2.1 (Perkin–Elmer).

Paternal alleles were identified by comparing the offspring and maternal genotypes. A search of genotypes for every male in the population identified those that possessed all the paternal alleles present, indicating that the male was the sire of the nestling. However, if the male did not possess one or more of the paternal alleles then the juvenile could have been fathered by another male. To determine the paternity of juveniles, we used a microsatellite genotyping method that was sensitive to paternity assignment (M. C. Double and A. Cockburn, unpublished data). In summary, microsatellite genotyping revealed that males from outside the female’s social group sired 1151 of the 1895 offspring. The true sire could not be identified for 250 of these 1151 illegitimate offspring (21.7%) because the male was not resident within the study area. The remaining 901 offspring (78.3%) were successfully assigned to extra-group males within the study area. We did not find any cases of intraspecific brood parasitism.

(c) Statistical analyses

A standardized male moult score was calculated for each adult male for each breeding season. This moult score was the number of standard deviations (s.d.) from the mean moult date for that year. For example, in 1993 the mean moult date in Julian days was 245.5 (s.d. = 56.6 days, n = 186). Therefore a male that was recorded as reaching full nuptial plumage on 26 April 1993 (113 Julian days) would have a moult score of \(-2.34\) \((\frac{113 - 245.5}{56.6})\). Males that retained nuptial plumage throughout the year were assigned a moult date of 60 Julian days, one day prior to the earliest moult from eclipse to breeding plumage recorded between 1993 and 2000. Males that did not acquire full nuptial plumage were assigned a moult date of 340 Julian days, one day after the latest moult recorded between 1993 and 2000.

We used JMP v. 3.0.2 (SAS Institute Inc.) for most analyses and Genstat v. 5 (release 4.2.000) for logistic regression models of extra-group paternity. Modelling was used to examine the effect of male age, standardized moult score, breeding unit (pair or group), presence of subordinates and year on the probability of males successfully siring one or more extra-group offspring. We used presence or absence of success as we could not fully measure the success of males towards the edge of the study area and the data were dominated by unsuccessful males. If the social status of a male was ambiguous then that male was removed from the analysis. This can occur when a dominant male dies and the two remaining subordinates are the same age. We also examined the influence of female age and the number of territories between the female and the most distant extra-group sire on the probability that a female’s brood contained a chick sired by a subordinate male.

Initially we fitted models containing all fixed and interaction terms. Terms were assessed by the change in deviance (which approximates a \(x^2\) distribution) and were progressively removed until the model contained only significant terms \((p < 0.05)\). Results presented for non-significant terms were those predicted by the model that contained all significant terms.

3. RESULTS

The general paternity data from this study will be reported elsewhere (M. C. Double and A. Cockburn, unpublished data). In summary, microsatellite genotyping revealed that males from outside the female’s social group sired 1151 of the 1895 offspring. The true sire could not be identified for 250 of these 1151 illegitimate offspring (21.7%) because the male was not resident within the study area. The remaining 901 offspring (78.3%) were successfully assigned to extra-group males within the study area. We did not find any cases of intraspecific brood parasitism.

(a) Moult score and extra-group paternity by subordinate males

Extra-group subordinate males sired 10.2% (193 out of 1895) of all offspring sampled between 1993 and 2000 and 21.4% (193 out of 901) of all assigned illegitimate offspring. Subordinate males sired young in 25.5% of 386 complete broods where it was possible to identify the social status of every sire. On average 27.4% of subordinate males sired young in each season although this figure fluctuated greatly from 10% (7 out of 69) in 1994 to 43% (15 out of 35) in 1999.

A logistic regression model that included all subordinates was unduly influenced by the leverage of extremely high moult scores found only among late-moultling 1-year-old birds in some years. To avoid this, 1-year-old and older subordinates were initially modelled separately. All interaction terms in the model of first-year subordinates were not significant. Year effects were highly significant.
significant factor in the model (similar outcome. Year was highly unstable but not a significant term in the model (p = 0.01). The modelling of older subordinates gave a similar outcome. Year was highly unstable but not a significant factor in the model (χ² = 6.6, d.f. = 1, p = 0.01). The modelling of older subordinates gave a similar outcome. Year was highly unstable but not a significant factor in the model (χ² = 11.2, d.f. = 7, p = 0.13). Again, the reproductive success of older subordinates was not influenced by their own moult scores (χ² = 2.7, d.f. = 1, p = 0.1) but increased if their dominant male moulted early in the season (figure 1; χ² = 8.3, d.f. = 1, p = 0.004).

Both subordinate and dominant males were then included in a single model that examined the effect of status, the presence of subordinates and the moult score of the dominant male on the probability of siring chicks outside the social group. As in previous studies, extra-group reproductive success of dominant males was predicted almost perfectly by their own moult scores (figure 1; cf. Dunn & Cockburn 1999; Green et al. 2000). Status (χ² = 20.6, d.f. = 1, p < 0.001), the dominant’s moult score (χ² = 72.4, d.f. = 1, p < 0.001) and the interaction between moult score and status (χ² = 5.2, d.f. = 1, p = 0.02) all remained as significant effects in the model (figure 1). The difference in the probability of siring extra-group offspring between dominants and subordinates was higher when the dominants moulted earlier. However, subordinates of attractive dominants were more likely to sire extra-group young than were the dominants with average moult scores. The presence of subordinates did not affect the extra-group success of dominants (χ² = 0.3, d.f. = 1, p = 0.6).

(b) Extra-group forays and subordinate paternity

The paternity data indicated that female fairy-wrens generally sought extra-group copulations over relatively short distances (figure 2). Males within one or two territories of the female accounted for the majority of extra-group paternities (87.1%; 785 out of 901), although in some cases paternity was assigned to males up to five territories (ca. 620 m) from the female’s own territory. Subordinate males tended to be more likely to sire extra-group offspring if the female had travelled further to seek extra-group copulations (figure 3; χ² = 3.6, d.f. = 1, p = 0.06) irrespective of the female’s age (χ² = 2.9, d.f. = 1, p = 0.08).

4. DISCUSSION

Subordinate males sired over one-fifth of all extra-group offspring of known parentage, and over one-quarter of all broods contained young sired by subordinate extra-group males. Such high rates of direct reproduction by subordinates have previously been reported only in cooperatively breeding birds where paternity is shared among unrelated members within a group (e.g. white-browed scrubwrens, S. frontalis (Whittingham et al. 1997); dunnocks, Prunella modularis (Burke et al. 1989); Galapagos hawks, Buteo galapagoensis (Faaborg et al. 1994); and brown skua, Catharacta lombergi (Millar et al. 1994)). By contrast, this is, to our knowledge, the first study to show that subordinate males can achieve high levels of reproductive success through extra-group copulations. Few minisatellite-based studies of cooperatively breeding birds have attempted to
assign extra-group sires (Mulder & Cockburn 1993; Dunn & Cockburn 1999) and to date only one, to our knowledge, has used microsatellites to assign extra-group offspring. In Richardson et al.’s (2001) study of Seychelles warblers, 38% (21 out of 55) of offspring were found to be illegitimate. Although all successful extra-group sires were dominants, male help is rare in this species.

From the dataset presented here Cockburn et al. (2003) reported that 65 within-group young were sired by subordinate males. Therefore, of offspring sired by males of known status, 26.7% (258 out of 966) of all extra-pair offspring and 15.7% (258 out of 1645) of all young sampled between 1993 and 2000 were sired by subordinates. Such direct reproductive success may provide an incentive for subordinates to remain on their natal territory and could explain the paradox that helpers often rear young to which they are unrelated (Dunn et al. 1995). However, experimental evidence indicates that subordinates will always disperse to a breeding vacancy if possible, despite having access to direct reproductive success (Pruett-Jones & Lewis 1990). This implies that within-pair matings are the major motivation for dispersal by subordinates of attractive males.

The extra-group reproductive success of subordinate superb fairy-wrens appears to be linked to the quality of their dominants rather than to their own prowess. Subordinate males on territories with early-moulting dominant males were more likely to sire extra-group offspring, irrespective of their own moult score. By contrast, the success of dominant males depended on the timing of their own moult into nuptial plumage, as reported elsewhere of dominant males depended on the timing of their own moulting into nuptial plumage, as reported elsewhere. By contrast, the success of offspring sired by males of attractive males. Therefore, of offspring sired by males of known status, 26.7% (258 out of 966) of all extra-pair offspring and 15.7% (258 out of 1645) of all young sampled between 1993 and 2000 were sired by subordinates. Such direct reproductive success may provide an incentive for subordinates to remain on their natal territory and could explain the paradox that helpers often rear young to which they are unrelated (Dunn et al. 1995). However, experimental evidence indicates that subordinates will always disperse to a breeding vacancy if possible, despite having access to direct reproductive success (Pruett-Jones & Lewis 1990). This implies that within-pair matings are the major motivation for dispersal by subordinates of attractive males.

The extra-group reproductive success of subordinate superb fairy-wrens appears to be linked to the quality of their dominants rather than to their own prowess. Subordinate males on territories with early-moulting dominant males were more likely to sire extra-group offspring, irrespective of their own moult score. By contrast, the success of dominant males depended on the timing of their own moult into nuptial plumage, as reported elsewhere. By contrast, the success of offspring sired by males of attractive males. Therefore, of offspring sired by males of known status, 26.7% (258 out of 966) of all extra-pair offspring and 15.7% (258 out of 1645) of all young sampled between 1993 and 2000 were sired by subordinates. Such direct reproductive success may provide an incentive for subordinates to remain on their natal territory and could explain the paradox that helpers often rear young to which they are unrelated (Dunn et al. 1995). However, experimental evidence indicates that subordinates will always disperse to a breeding vacancy if possible, despite having access to direct reproductive success (Pruett-Jones & Lewis 1990). This implies that within-pair matings are the major motivation for dispersal by subordinates of attractive males.

The extra-group reproductive success of subordinate superb fairy-wrens appears to be linked to the quality of their dominants rather than to their own prowess. Subordinate males on territories with early-moulting dominant males were more likely to sire extra-group offspring, irrespective of their own moult score. By contrast, the success of dominant males depended on the timing of their own moult into nuptial plumage, as reported elsewhere. By contrast, the success of offspring sired by males of attractive males. Therefore, of offspring sired by males of known status, 26.7% (258 out of 966) of all extra-pair offspring and 15.7% (258 out of 1645) of all young sampled between 1993 and 2000 were sired by subordinates. Such direct reproductive success may provide an incentive for subordinates to remain on their natal territory and could explain the paradox that helpers often rear young to which they are unrelated (Dunn et al. 1995). However, experimental evidence indicates that subordinates will always disperse to a breeding vacancy if possible, despite having access to direct reproductive success (Pruett-Jones & Lewis 1990). This implies that within-pair matings are the major motivation for dispersal by subordinates of attractive males.

The extra-group reproductive success of subordinate superb fairy-wrens appears to be linked to the quality of their dominants rather than to their own prowess. Subordinate males on territories with early-moulting dominant males were more likely to sire extra-group offspring, irrespective of their own moult score. By contrast, the success of dominant males depended on the timing of their own moult into nuptial plumage, as reported elsewhere. By contrast, the success of offspring sired by males of attractive males. Therefore, of offspring sired by males of known status, 26.7% (258 out of 966) of all extra-pair offspring and 15.7% (258 out of 1645) of all young sampled between 1993 and 2000 were sired by subordinates. Such direct reproductive success may provide an incentive for subordinates to remain on their natal territory and could explain the paradox that helpers often rear young to which they are unrelated (Dunn et al. 1995). However, experimental evidence indicates that subordinates will always disperse to a breeding vacancy if possible, despite having access to direct reproductive success (Pruett-Jones & Lewis 1990). This implies that within-pair matings are the major motivation for dispersal by subordinates of attractive males.

The extra-group reproductive success of subordinate superb fairy-wrens appears to be linked to the quality of their dominants rather than to their own prowess. Subordinate males on territories with early-moulting dominant males were more likely to sire extra-group offspring, irrespective of their own moult score. By contrast, the success of dominant males depended on the timing of their own moult into nuptial plumage, as reported elsewhere. By contrast, the success of offspring sired by males of attractive males. Therefore, of offspring sired by males of known status, 26.7% (258 out of 966) of all extra-pair offspring and 15.7% (258 out of 1645) of all young sampled between 1993 and 2000 were sired by subordinates. Such direct reproductive success may provide an incentive for subordinates to remain on their natal territory and could explain the paradox that helpers often rear young to which they are unrelated (Dunn et al. 1995). However, experimental evidence indicates that subordinates will always disperse to a breeding vacancy if possible, despite having access to direct reproductive success (Pruett-Jones & Lewis 1990). This implies that within-pair matings are the major motivation for dispersal by subordinates of attractive males.

The extra-group reproductive success of subordinate superb fairy-wrens appears to be linked to the quality of their dominants rather than to their own prowess. Subordinate males on territories with early-moulting dominant males were more likely to sire extra-group offspring, irrespective of their own moult score. By contrast, the success of dominant males depended on the timing of their own moult into nuptial plumage, as reported elsewhere. By contrast, the success of offspring sired by males of attractive males. Therefore, of offspring sired by males of known status, 26.7% (258 out of 966) of all extra-pair offspring and 15.7% (258 out of 1645) of all young sampled between 1993 and 2000 were sired by subordinates. Such direct reproductive success may provide an incentive for subordinates to remain on their natal territory and could explain the paradox that helpers often rear young to which they are unrelated (Dunn et al. 1995). However, experimental evidence indicates that subordinates will always disperse to a breeding vacancy if possible, despite having access to direct reproductive success (Pruett-Jones & Lewis 1990). This implies that within-pair matings are the major motivation for dispersal by subordinates of attractive males.
display to extra-group females. However, display rate per se does not influence extra-group success (Green et al. 2000). Perhaps, because females conduct pre-dawn forays during a very brief period, dominants cannot copulate with multiple females. Thus subordinates do not necessarily reduce the dominants’ extra-group success and can even provide indirect benefits if the subordinate is a legitimate son.

This research was funded by the Australian Research Council. We are grateful to the Australian National Botanic Gardens and the ANU Animal Experimentation Ethics Committee for permission to carry out the work. Invaluable help in the field was provided by Helen Osmond. We thank Nadeena Beck, Caroline Blackmore, Naomi Langmore and two anonymous referees for their valuable comments on this manuscript.

REFERENCES


Magrath, R. D. & Whittingham, L. A. 1997 Subordinate males are more likely to help if unrelated to the breeding female in cooperatively breeding white-browed scrubwrens. *Behav. Ecol. Sociobiol.* 41, 185–192.


